

## SCCWRP Annual Report 2009

# Assessing coastal benthic macrofauna community condition using best professional judgement: Developing consensus across North America and Europe

Heliana Teixeira<sup>1</sup>, Ángel Borja<sup>2</sup>, Stephen B. Weisberg, J. Ananda Ranasinghe, Donald B. Cadien<sup>3</sup>, Daniel M. Dauer<sup>4</sup>, Jean-Claude Dauvin<sup>5</sup>, Steven Degraer<sup>6</sup>, Robert J. Diaz<sup>7</sup>, Antoine Grémare<sup>8</sup>, Ioannis Karakassis<sup>9</sup>, Roberto J. Llansó<sup>10</sup>, Lawrence L. Lovell<sup>3</sup>, João C. Marques<sup>1</sup>, David E. Montagne<sup>11</sup>, Anna Occhipinti-Ambrogi<sup>12</sup>, Rutger Rosenberg<sup>13</sup>, Rafael Sardá<sup>14</sup>, Linda C. Schaffner<sup>7</sup> and Ronald G. Velarde<sup>15</sup>

<sup>1</sup>University of Coimbra, Institute of Marine Research (IMAR), Faculty of Sciences and Technology, Coimbra, Portugal

<sup>2</sup>AZTI – Tecnalia, Marine Research Division, Herrera Kaia Portualdea, Pasaia, Spain

<sup>3</sup>Sanitation Districts of Los Angeles County, Ocean Monitoring and Research Group, Carson, CA

<sup>4</sup>Old Dominion University, Department of Biological Sciences, Norfolk, VA

<sup>5</sup>Université de Lille1, Laboratoire d'Océanologie et de Géosciences, Station Marine de Wimereux, Wimereux, France

<sup>6</sup>Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences, Management Unit of the North Sea Mathematical Models, Marine Ecosystem Management Section, Brussels, Belgium

<sup>7</sup>College of William and Mary, School of Marine Science, Department of Biological Sciences, Virginia Institute of Marine Science, Gloucester Point, VA

<sup>8</sup>Université Bordeaux, EPOC, Station Marine d'Arcachon, Arcachon, France

<sup>9</sup>University of Crete, Department of Biology, Marine Ecology Lab, Crete, Greece

<sup>10</sup>Versar, Inc., Columbia, MD

<sup>11</sup>Retired, Sanitation Districts of Los Angeles County, Whittier, CA

<sup>12</sup>Department of Ecologia del Territorio, Section of Ecology, Pavia, Italy

<sup>13</sup>University of Gothenburg, Kristineberg, Department of Marine Ecology, Fiskebäckskil, Sweden

<sup>14</sup>Centre d'Estudis Avançats de Blanes, CSIC, Cta. Accés a la Cala Sant Francesc, Girona, Spain

<sup>15</sup>City of San Diego, Marine Biology Laboratory, San Diego, CA

## ABSTRACT

Benthic indices are typically developed independently by habitat, making their incorporation into large geographic scale assessments potentially problematic because of scaling inequities. A potential solution is to establish common scaling using expert best professional judgment (BPJ). To test if experts from different geographies agree on condition assessment, 16 experts from 4 regions in USA and Europe were provided species-abundance data for 12 sites per region. The experts ranked samples from best to worst condition and classified samples into four categories. Site rankings were highly correlated among experts, regardless of whether they were assessing samples from their home region. Also, there was good agreement on condition category, though agreement was better for samples at extremes of the disturbance gradient. The absence of regional bias suggests that expert judgment is a viable means for establishing a uniform scale to calibrate indices consistently across geographic regions.

## Full Text

[ftp://ftp.sccwrp.org/pub/download/DOCUMENTS/AnnualReports/2009AnnualReport/AR09\\_043\\_059.pdf](ftp://ftp.sccwrp.org/pub/download/DOCUMENTS/AnnualReports/2009AnnualReport/AR09_043_059.pdf)